Homework 6: Critical Reading of an AOP Paper

Due: Thursday, December 4, 2003.

This homework should be done individually. Its purpose is to have you think about issues in aspect-oriented langauges and to learn how to approach papers critically.

Don't hesitate to contact the staff if you are not clear about what to do.

1. (30 points) Read the paper by Clifton and Leavens, "Spectators and Assistants: Enabling Modular Aspect-Oriented Reasoning." (Department of Computer Science, Iowa State University, TR #02-10, October 2002, available from the course syllabus web page).

   This paper was rejected by a prominent aspect-oriented software development conference — for some good reasons. Think about the problem and the solution offered, and describe what is wrong with the paper's solution to the problems it addresses.

   If you think that the paper is fine as it is, but the ideas need more validation, describe what more work would be required to make the paper convincing. For example, you might describe (in general terms) implementation work or experiments.

2. (20 points; extra credit) A useful idea for presenting papers is learning how to recast it so that the problems and claims made are appropriate for the solution offered. How would you recast the paper's problems, claims, and solution so that it would be more acceptable?